

Memo on US DOL Bulletin Regarding ESG Investing

This past April, the US Department of Labor (DOL) issued Field Assistance Bulletin No. 2018-01, which provides guidance to plan fiduciaries as it relates to ESG Investment Considerations and Shareholder Engagement Activities. While this bulletin has garnered a lot of coverage, and has been viewed by some as being limiting for ESG-minded investors, the bulletin's guidance is not as controversial as it would seem at first glance.

ESG Investment Considerations

At the center of the concern is the DOL's statement on fiduciaries' obligations as it relates to the management of investments:

...because every investment necessarily causes a plan to forego other investment opportunities, plan fiduciaries are not permitted to sacrifice investment return or take on additional investment risk as a means of using plan investments to promote collateral social policy goals.

This does not necessarily mean that the DOL is attempting to restrict ESG investing. The DOL further clarifies its remark by stating:

...when competing investments serve the plan's economic interests equally well, plan fiduciaries can use such collateral considerations as tie-breakers for an investment choice.

It is our view that ESG investment strategies do not necessarily require sacrificing investment return or taking on greater investment risk. **Exhibit 1** illustrates the results of several naively constructed fundamentally weighted ESG strategies that exclude certain controversial industries: alcohol, tobacco, guns, fossil fuels, and all four industries combined. In both the US market and the developed markets ex US, excess returns for the exclusionary strategies are not meaningfully different from the fundamentally weighted portfolio. Far beyond being a tie-breaker, a thoughtfully designed, smart beta index strategy that incorporates ESG themes can deliver on the dual objectives of excess returns versus the market benchmark and social responsibility.

Memo on US DOL Bulletin Regarding ESG Investing

This past April, the US Department of Labor (DOL) issued Field Assistance Bulletin No. 2018-01, which provides guidance to plan fiduciaries as it relates to ESG Investment Considerations and Shareholder Engagement Activities. While this bulletin has garnered a lot of coverage, and has been viewed by some as being limiting for ESG-minded investors, the bulletin's guidance is not as controversial as it would seem at first glance.

ESG Investment Considerations

At the center of the concern is the DOL's statement on fiduciaries' obligations as it relates to the management of investments:

...because every investment necessarily causes a plan to forego other investment opportunities, plan fiduciaries are not permitted to sacrifice investment return or take on additional investment risk as a means of using plan investments to promote collateral social policy goals.

This does not necessarily mean that the DOL is attempting to restrict ESG investing. The DOL further clarifies its remark by stating:

...when competing investments serve the plan's economic interests equally well, plan fiduciaries can use such collateral considerations as tie-breakers for an investment choice.

It is our view that ESG investment strategies do not necessarily require sacrificing investment return or taking on greater investment risk. **Exhibit 1** illustrates the results of several naively constructed fundamentally weighted ESG strategies that exclude certain controversial industries: alcohol, tobacco, guns, fossil fuels, and all four industries combined. In both the US market and the developed markets ex US, excess returns for the exclusionary strategies are not meaningfully different from the fundamentally weighted portfolio. Far beyond being a tie-breaker, a thoughtfully designed, smart beta index strategy that incorporates ESG themes can deliver on the dual objectives of excess returns versus the market benchmark and social responsibility.

Strong corporate governance and financial discipline has been shown to add value by increasing returns¹ and/or mitigating risk.² The strong governance and financial discipline of a firm help ensure the company is being run for the long-term benefit of shareholders and not the short-term benefit of managers. Shareholder engagement in relation to material ESG themes can lead to better investor outcomes and is not only related to promoting collateral social benefits.

Conclusion

In conclusion, we believe that the recent DOL bulletin should not discourage fiduciaries from pursuing ESG-related investment strategies. Any investment strategy, ESG themed or not, should be properly vetted against the objectives of a plan's investment policy statement. Properly designed investment strategies promoting ESG themes can be appropriate in meeting the fiduciary requirements of a plan sponsor.

Important Information

The material contained in this document is for information purposes only. This material is not intended as an offer or solicitation for the purchase or sale of any security or financial instrument, nor is it advice or a recommendation to enter into any transaction. The information contained herein should not be construed as financial or investment advice on any subject matter. Although the data and information presented have been derived from sources deemed reliable, they are provided on an "as is" basis without any warranties of any kind.

Research Affiliates, LLC and its related entities do not warrant the accuracy of the information provided herein, either expressed or implied, for any particular purpose. Nothing contained in this material is intended to constitute legal, tax, securities or investment advice, nor an opinion regarding the appropriateness of any investment, nor a solicitation of any type. The general information contained in this material should not be acted upon without obtaining specific legal, tax and investment advice from a licensed professional. Investors should be aware of the risks associated with data sources and quantitative processes used in our investment management process. Errors may exist in data acquired from third party vendors, the construction of model portfolios, and in coding related to the index and portfolio construction process. While Research Affiliates takes steps to identify data and process errors so as to minimize the potential impact of such errors on index and portfolio performance, we cannot guarantee that such errors will not occur.

Investors should be aware of the risks associated with data sources and quantitative processes used to create the content contained herein or the investment management process. Errors may exist in data acquired from third party vendors, the construction or coding of indices or model portfolios, and the construction of the spreadsheets, results or information provided. While Research Affiliates takes steps to eliminate or mitigate errors and to identify data and process errors so as to minimize the potential impact of such errors, Research Affiliates cannot guarantee that such errors will not occur and use of this information is conditioned upon and evidence of the user's full release of Research Affiliates from any liability or responsibility for any damages that may result from the use of this content.

¹ "[Unlocking the Performance Potential in ESG Investing](#)," by Li, Sherrerd, and Treussard, Research Affiliates Publications, March 2018.

² "ESG Factors and Risk-Adjusted Performance: A New Quantitative Model," by Kumar, Smith, Badis, Wang, Ambrosy, and Taveres, *Journal of Sustainable Finance and Investment*, 2016.



The trademarks Fundamental Index™, RAFI™, Research Affiliates Equity™, RAE™ and the Research Affiliates™ trademark and corporate name and all related logos are the exclusive intellectual property of Research Affiliates, LLC and in some cases are registered trademarks in the U.S. and other countries. Various features of the Fundamental Index™ methodology, including an accounting data-based non-capitalization data processing system and method for creating and weighting an index of securities, are protected by various patents, and patent-pending intellectual property of Research Affiliates, LLC. (See all applicable US Patents, Patent Publications, Patent Pending intellectual property and protected trademarks located at https://www.researchaffiliates.com/en_us/about-us/legal.html, which are fully incorporated herein.) Any use of these trademarks, logos, patented or patent pending methodologies without the prior written permission of Research Affiliates, LLC, is expressly prohibited. Research Affiliates, LLC, reserves the right to take any and all necessary action to preserve all of its rights, title, and interest in and to these marks, patents or pending patents.

Research Affiliates, LLC is a wholly owned subsidiary of Research Affiliates Global Holdings, LLC and does not offer or provide investment advice or offer or sell any securities, commodities or derivative instruments or products. Any such business may only be conducted through registered or licensed entities and individuals permitted to do so within the respective jurisdiction and only in conjunction with the legally required disclosure documents and subject to the all legally required regulatory filings.

Research Affiliates, LLC, its affiliates, agents, and each of their respective officers, directors, employees, agents, representatives and licensors (collectively "RA") shall not be liable to any third party for any loss or damage, direct, indirect or consequential, arising from or related to (i) any inaccuracy or incompleteness in, errors or omissions in the provided information or (ii) any decision made or action taken by any third party in reliance upon this information. RA does not make any warranties, express or implied, to anyone regarding the information, including, without limitation, any warranties with respect to the timeliness, sequence, accuracy, completeness, currentness, merchantability, quality or fitness for a particular purpose or any warranties as to the results to be obtained by any third-party in connection with the use of the information. RA shall not be liable to anyone for loss of business revenues, lost profits or any indirect, consequential, special or similar damages whatsoever, whether in contract, tort or otherwise, even if advised of the possibility of such damages.

© 2019 Research Affiliates, LLC. All rights reserved. Duplication or dissemination prohibited without prior written permission.

